

## CENTRE FOR PUBLIC LAW



### ILS LAW COLLEGE, PUNE.

#### 6<sup>TH</sup> ILS NATIONAL ALTERNATE JUDGMENT WRITING COMPETITION, 2018-19

#### **I. OBJECTIVES.**

- A. To enable participants to rethink and analyse Judgments of the Supreme Court & High Court.
- B. To sharpen Research & Writing skills.
- C. To enable them to reimagine the reasoning underlying the cases.

#### **II. ELIGIBILITY.**

Any student from any law college or law university may participate in this competition. No restrictions are placed on the number of students applying from one institution. The participants should be pursuing 5-year or 3-year law course or LL.M.<sup>1</sup>

#### **III. THE COMPETITION.**

- A. The Competition is not open to teams and shall be open to only individuals.
- B. The Competition shall comprise of 2 rounds; Written Submissions and Oral Presentation.

---

<sup>1</sup> The participation of Students from the LL.M course is contingent on the receipt of a minimum of 10 entries and their judgments and presentation shall be assessed separately.

- C. The participants are expected to produce creative, innovative well-researched legally and logically sound alternate judgments, original in matter and thought.
- D. Each participant is expected to reconstruct the arguments of the Petitioner(s) and the Respondent(s) in addition to analysing, critiquing and evaluating the judgment of the Court. The participants are expected to identify and examine lacunae, if any, in the reasoning of the Court and highlight significant alternate conclusions, inferences and legal positions.
- E. The participants are neither encouraged nor expected to substantially reproduce the original judgment of the Court or the Case Note provided for the Competition and is expected to invest individual effort.
- F. The participants have the privilege of authoring concurring or dissenting opinions. Such concurrence or dissent shall be reasoned, analysed and expounded clearly in the Written Submission and during the Oral Presentations.
- G. Each participant shall write and submit a Written Submission of their Alternate Judgment to be assessed by the Judges by **20<sup>th</sup> January 2019**.
- H. Five participants<sup>2</sup> with the highest scores shall qualify to the Second Round, which is the Oral Presentation. The assessment result of the Written Submission shall be announced on **4<sup>th</sup> of February 2019**.
- I. Each participant shall make an oral presentation of their Alternate Judgment before the Judges on **25<sup>th</sup> February 2019**,<sup>3</sup> at ILS Law College, Pune.
- J. The participants shall not be entitled to free accommodation or any travel allowance.<sup>4</sup> The Organising Committee may arrange accommodation on a participant's personal request and expense.

#### **IV. THE WRITTEN SUBMISSION.**

- A. The Written Submissions shall comprise of the following:
1. Relevant Facts before the Court.
  2. Issues in controversy.
  3. Submissions of the Petitioner.
  4. Submissions of the Respondent.

---

<sup>2</sup> The number of participants qualifying to the Second Round is subject to increase depending upon the number of Alternate Judgments received.

<sup>3</sup> Subject to revision. Participants shall be duly informed of any change in schedule.

<sup>4</sup> Subject to revision contingent to the actual number of entries and sponsorship. Participants shall be duly informed of any such revision.

5. Reasoning of the Court.
6. Summary and Analysis of Relevant National enactments and International legal instruments.
7. Alternate Inferences, Opinions and Legal position (if any)
8. Conclusion: Concurrence or Dissent with specified grounds of such concurrence with or dissent from the Judgment.

B. Language: English

C. Word Limit: 3000 words (including footnotes)

D. File Format: Doc and PDF (submissions in both format to be made)

E. Font: Times New Roman

F. Font Size: 12 for Text; 10 for footnotes

G. Page Number: Bottom Centre.

H. No information relating to the participant or his institution shall be disclosed in the written submission except the Participant's Code that shall be assigned to each participant.

#### **V. SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS.**

Considering this year's case, the participants are expected to note the following special instructions:

- A. The participants should avoid overindulgence in adversarial argumentation considering the fact that the judgment concerns a PIL.
- B. It is desirable that a collaborative effort is made by the parties and the court to promote and sharply conceptualize the rights of persons with disabilities.
- C. The participants are expected to include in the Alternate Judgment the appropriate standards of International Human Rights Laws.
- D. The participants are expected to be conversant with the models of the Disability Rights Movement and are expected to identify the appropriate model of disability, in light of International Human Rights Law in general and in particular the United Nations Convention on Rights of Persons with Disability.

## VI. CASE NAME AND CITATION

*National Federation of the  
Blind, Maharashtra*

v.

*High Court of Judicature  
of Bombay*

2018 SCC Online Bom 931

## VII. MARKING SCHEME

<i>Statement of Facts</i>	<b>10 Marks</b>
<i>Statement of Rival Contentions and Framing of Issues</i>	<b>15 Marks</b>
<i>Application of Relevant Law including precedents, international legal instruments and national enactments.</i>	<b>20 Marks</b>
<i>Critical Analysis and Reasoning</i>	<b>20 Marks</b>
<i>Presentation, Style, Clarity, Appearance and Overall Impression</i>	<b>10 Marks</b>
<i>Oral Presentation</i>	<b>75 Marks</b>

## VIII. REGISTRATION.

- Visit the official website of ILS Law College, Pune at <https://ilslaw.edu/>.
- Find and Click on the NAJW 2018-19 tab on the Website.
- Complete Provisional Registration at:  
[https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLSdmkAfguC9yPdhU2Rk5pQ8H HpL\\_c3j5pixaPBvMcJbmdVijVw/viewform?usp=sf\\_link](https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLSdmkAfguC9yPdhU2Rk5pQ8H HpL_c3j5pixaPBvMcJbmdVijVw/viewform?usp=sf_link) by **10<sup>th</sup> January 2019.**
- Download the Application Form.
- Pay the registration fee of Rs. 511/- (inclusive of GST). The details for payment are as follows:

<b>Account Number:</b>	490076558
<b>Bank:</b>	Indian Bank
<b>IFSC:</b>	IDIB000D007

- F. Scan the filled *application form* and send it to [najw.cpl@gmail.com](mailto:najw.cpl@gmail.com) along with the *receipt of the NEFT transaction* and the *soft copy of the Written Submission* by **20<sup>th</sup> January 2019**.
- G. Send the *application form*, *hard copy of the receipt of the NEFT Transaction* and the *Written Submission* to “**Dr. Sanjay Jain, Faculty Co-ordinator, The Centre for Public Law, ILS Law College, Law College Road, Pune, Maharashtra – 411004**” to be received by **25<sup>th</sup> January 2019** to complete the Registration process.
- H. The contents of the soft copy and the hard copy of the Written Submission shall be identical with no variations.

**IX. PRIZES.**

<i>First Prize</i>	<b>Rs. 10,000</b>
<i>Second Prize</i>	<b>Rs. 8,000</b>
<i>Third Prize</i>	<b>Rs. 5,000</b>

**X. CONTACT**

For more information and other queries feel free to contact:

<i>Rajmohan C.V.</i>	<b>8943790407</b>	<i>Pranay Jaiswal</i>	<b>8446623583</b>
<i>Ayush Wadhi.</i>	<b>7276632334</b>	<i>Kirti Kapoor</i>	<b>7719848155</b>
<i>Anshika Sharma.</i>	<b>9969994959</b>	<i>Email:</i>	<a href="mailto:najw.cpl@gmail.com">najw.cpl@gmail.com</a>